

Option / Scenario	Description	Floor space	Strategic Alignment	Financials	Economic Case	Deliverability	Overall Rating
Business as Usual	No investment in new facilities. The Green Car Park site will remain as a car park. The existing Library in Waterloo will still require significant investment in the short term, and continue to provide high costs to council in management and maintenance.	NA	This option does not support any local, regional or national priorities in terms of improving access or life outcomes for our communities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Upfront Costs: High, including emergency repairs ▪ Whole Life Costs: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Economic Benefits: lower than Option 2 ▪ Wider public welfare benefits: lower than Option 2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Achievability : Good ▪ Financial delivery: Poor 	Discounted - Not a suitable option
Option 1 - New Library only	The Green Car Park will be developed to deliver a new Library only. The existing library will be closed, but not developed. Healthcare services will continue to be distributed, and no other development proposed.	800 sqm	Aligns with local strategy to improve Crosby village centre, but creates a high financial burden on Council for the development and continued maintenance of the existing library site.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Upfront Costs: High, for the development of new facility ▪ Whole Life Costs: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Economic Benefits: lower than Option 2 ▪ Wider public welfare benefits: lower than Option 2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Achievability : Good ▪ Financial delivery: Poor 	Discounted - Not a suitable option
Option 2 - New Library, Healthcare centre and Office provision	The Green Car Park site will be developed into a new Library, healthcare, and office hub. The existing library will be closed, land will remain in Council's ownership (no new development proposed here).	2,360 sqm	Aligns with local strategy to improve Crosby village centre, and delivers a range of services from one site. But creates a high financial burden on Council for the development and continued maintenance of the existing library site.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Upfront Costs: Very High ▪ Whole Life Costs: High, but revenue potential by renting out the Healthcare and Office space 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Economic Benefits: High (~£5.1m p.a.) ▪ Wider public welfare benefits: High (£28.8m over a 5 year appraisal period) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Achievability : Good ▪ Financial delivery: Poor 	Discounted - Not a suitable option

Option / Scenario	Description	Floors pace	Strategic Alignment	Financials	Economic Case	Deliverability	Overall Rating
Option 3 – As per Option 2, but existing Library site sold to private developer	The Green Car Park site will be developed into a new Library, healthcare, and office hub. The existing library will be sold to a developer for residential led redevelopment.	2,360 sqm	Generally good alignment with local, regional and national policy. Potential issues with developer led approach to former library site, however this could be mitigated through negotiation and SMBC control of any development agreement.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upfront Costs: unclear; likely to be upfront revenue due to the sale of the existing library site which could be used to cross subsidise the development of the new facilities. Whole Life Costs: Low, rental costs at new Library site only. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic Benefits: High Wider public welfare benefits: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability: Good Financial delivery: Potentially Good 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Taken forward
Option 4 - New Library, Healthcare centre and Residential above	The Green Car Park site will be developed into a new Library and healthcare hub, with residential development above (As per LUF Round 1 funding bid scheme). The existing library will be closed, but remain in council ownership.	4,470 sqm	Aligns with local strategy to improve Crosby village centre, and delivers a range of services from one site. But creates potential policy challenges due to amenity and open space for incoming residents in the town centre.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upfront Costs: higher than option 2 Whole Life Costs: higher than option 2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic Benefits: High Wider public welfare benefits: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability: Poor, due to planning restrictions Financial delivery: Poor 	Discounted - Not a suitable option
Option 5 – As per Option 4, but existing Library site sold to private developer	As above, but the existing Library site in Waterloo will be sold off to a developer to deliver housing led development.	4,470 sqm	Generally good alignment with local, regional and national policy. Potential issues with developer led approach to former library site, however this could be mitigated through negotiation and SMBC control of any development agreement. Also creates potential policy challenges due to amenity and open space for incoming residents into town centre residential units.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upfront Costs: Potential for revenue generation from sale of housing Whole Life Costs: Low, rental costs at new Library site only. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic Benefits: High Wider public welfare benefits: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability: Poor, due to planning restrictions Financial delivery: Good 	Discounted - Not a suitable option

Option / Scenario	Description	Floors pace	Strategic Alignment	Financials	Economic Case	Deliverability	Overall Rating
Option 6 – New Library and Residential development	Green Car Park will be developed into a new Library with residential development above. The existing library will be closed, land will remain in Council's ownership.	2,250 sqm	Generally good alignment. But creates potential policy challenges due to amenity and open space for incoming residents.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upfront Costs: High Whole Life Costs: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic Benefits: High Wider public welfare benefits: High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability: Poor Financial delivery: Poor 	Discounted - Not a suitable option
Option 7 – Development partnership approach – New Library, Old Library plus further sites across the borough	Developer takes over both the existing library site and the Green Car Park. Green car park to be developed to library, health hub/office space. Existing library to be developed to provide homes. Further sites need to be added to make project viable for developer – potentially between 10-20 sites across the borough	Sig.	Generally good in terms of overall policy alignment. However potentially too many issues associated with local procurement, social value and potential planning and policy challenges.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Unclear, however likely a positive financial position could be negotiated for the Council 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Benefits likely to be high in fast tracking economic and regeneration projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability: unclear Financial delivery: Good 	Discounted - Not a suitable option
Option 8 – Council led redevelopment of the Green car park and existing library site (Waterloo)	Similar to Option 3, but Council led. Green Car Park will be developed into a Library and health hub/office. The existing library site will be redeveloped for residential led mixed-use development.	2,250 sqm	Good alignment and covers a number of strategic policy drivers including affordable residential development and improved town centres.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upfront Costs – High, but potentially offset by sale of residential development on Waterloo site, leading to funds to cross subsidise the Green Car Park Whole Life Costs – Low, rental costs at new Library site only. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic Benefits - High Wider public welfare benefits – High 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievability – Good Financial delivery – Good 	Taken forward

